

Impact of Nationalism on Economic Attitudes: Cross-Level Consistency or Ecological Fallacy?

Marharyta Fabrykant

Nationalism and Economic Attitudes: Why It Matters

- 1) Global:
Revival / re-imagining/ re-inventing / re-enchanting nationalism.**
- 2) Regional:
post-Socialist U-turn (Kornai, 2015).**
- 3) Russia:
“patriots” vs liberals.**

Nationalism and Economic Attitudes: What It Can Mean

- 1) Nationalism as political right wing ideology vs. conservatism contingent upon the country-specific economic past to “conserve”.**
- 2) Nationalism as solidarism vs nationalism as satisfaction with one’s own position in society.**

Ecological Fallacy?..

Hypothesis 1: individual level nationalism is positively related to support for income redistribution and a stronger state, and country level average scores on nationalism, to the support for free market economy.

Hypothesis 2: unlike nationalism, cosmopolitanism at both individual and country level fosters support for income redistribution and restrictions upon competition in the economy.

Dependent Variables (WVS, Wave 6)

- Income equality**
- Preference for government vs. people's responsibility for the economy**
- Economic competition good or harmful**
- Wealth accumulation possible at the expense of others or beneficial for all**

All variables measured on a 10-point scale.

Independent Variables (WVS, Wave 6)

- ❑ national pride (“How proud are you of your nationality” - “very proud”, “somewhat proud”, “not very proud”, “not proud at all”)
- ❑ national identity (“I see myself as a part of my nation” – “strongly agree” “agree”, “disagree”, “strongly disagree”)
- ❑ cosmopolitan identity (“I see myself as a citizen of the world” – “strongly agree” “agree”, “disagree”, “strongly disagree”).

All predictors entered first at the individual and then at the aggregate country levels.

Country-level effects of nationalism and cosmopolitanism on attitudes towards income equality

	M1.1	M1.2	M1.3
Individual level effects			
Age	-0.003*(0.001)	-0.003*(0.001)	-0.003*(0.001)
gender (ref female)	-0.058(0.020)*	-0.058(0.020)*	-0.058(0.020)*
Education	0.046(0.005)***	0.046(0.005)***	0.046(0.005)***
Social class (ref upper)			
upper middle	0.082(0.069)	0.082(0.069)	0.082(0.069)
lower middle	-0.188(0.068)*	-0.188(0.068)*	-0.188(0.068)*
working	-0.313(0.069)***	-0.313(0.069)***	-0.313(0.069)***
lower	-0.559(0.063)***	-0.556(0.073)***	-0.559(0.063)***
Country level effects			
log GDP pc PPP	-0.002(0.144)	-0.156(0.155)	-0.152(0.157)
National pride	1.482(0.389)**		
National identity		0.937(0.418)*	
Cosmopolitan identity			0.666(0.692)
N1	79307	79307	79307
N2	59	59	59

Country-level effects of nationalism and cosmopolitanism on attitudes towards government responsibility

	M2.1	M2.2	M2.3
Individual level effects			
Age	-0.001(0.000)	-0.001(0.000)	-0.001(0.000)
gender (ref female)	-0.060(0.019)**	-0.060(0.019)**	-0.060(0.019)**
Education	0.039(0.005)***	0.039(0.005)***	0.039(0.005)***
Social class (ref upper)			
upper middle	-0.022(0.068)	-0.022(0.068)	-0.022(0.068)
lower middle	-0.294(0.068)***	-0.294(0.068)***	-0.294(0.068)***
working	-0.439(0.068)***	-0.439(0.068)***	-0.439(0.068)***
lower	-0.750(0.062)***	-0.750(0.062)***	-0.750(0.062)***
Country level effects			
log GDP pc PPP	0.362(0.146)	0.234(0.144)	0.375(0.129)**
National pride	-0.553*(0.395)		
National identity		-0.648(0.637)	
Cosmopolitan identity			1.518(0.347)***
N1	79924	79924	79924
N2	59	59	59

Country-level effects of nationalism and cosmopolitanism on attitudes towards economic competition

	M3.1	M3.2	M3.3
Individual level effects			
Age	-0.004(0.001)***	-0.004(0.001)***	-0.004(0.001)***
gender (ref female)	0.169(0.018)***	0.169(0.018)***	0.169(0.018)***
Education	-0.058(0.004)***	-0.058(0.004)***	-0.058(0.004)***
Social class (ref upper)			
upper middle	-0.289(0.062)***	-0.289(0.062)***	-0.289(0.062)***
lower middle	-0.189(0.062)**	-0.189(0.062)**	-0.189(0.062)**
working	-0.176(0.063)*	-0.176(0.063)*	-0.176(0.063)*
lower	-0.092(0.066)	-0.092(0.066)	-0.092(0.066)
Country level effects			
log GDP pc PPP	0.113(0.110)	0.099(0.105)	0.228(0.105)
National pride	-0.610(0.299)*		
National identity		-1.318(0.463)*	
Cosmopolitan identity			0.468(0.303)
N1	79125	79125	79125
N2	59	59	59

Country-level effects of nationalism and cosmopolitanism on attitudes towards wealth accumulation

	M4.1	M4.2	M4.3
Individual level effects			
Age	0.005(0.001) ^{***}	0.005(0.001) ^{***}	0.005(0.001) ^{***}
gender (ref female)	0.126(0.019) ^{***}	0.126(0.019) ^{***}	0.126(0.019) ^{***}
Education	0.026(0.0050) ^{***}	0.026(0.0050) ^{***}	0.026(0.0050) ^{***}
Social class (ref upper)			
upper middle	0.302(0.065) ^{***}	0.302(0.065) ^{***}	0.302(0.065) ^{***}
lower middle	0.103(0.065)	0.103(0.065)	0.103(0.065)
working	0.005(0.065)	0.005(0.065)	0.005(0.065)
lower	-0.253(0.069) ^{**}	-0.253(0.069) ^{**}	-0.253(0.069) ^{**}
Country level effects			
log GDP pc PPP	0.010(0.112)	-0.012(0.111)	0.014(0.111)
National pride	0.748(0.303) ^{**}		
National identity		1.116(0.489) [*]	
Cosmopolitan identity			0.453(0.364)
N1	78099	78099	78099
N2	59	59	59

Individual level effects of nationalism and cosmopolitanism on attitudes towards income equality

	M5.1	M5.2	M5.3
Individual level effects			
age	-0.004(0.001)***	-0.003(0.001)***	-0.003(0.001)***
gender	-0.057(0.020)*	-0.057(0.020)*	-0.057(0.020)*
education	0.047(0.005)***	0.045(0.005)***	0.045(0.005)***
Social class (ref upper)			
upper middle	0.110(0.070)	0.086(0.070)	0.086(0.070)
lower middle	-0.152(0.069)*	-0.182(0.069)*	-0.182(0.069)*
working	-0.276(0.070)**	-0.303(0.070)**	-0.303(0.070)**
lower	-0.504(0.074)***	-0.546(0.074)***	-0.546(0.074)***
National pride (ref not proud at all)			
not very proud	-0.042(0.083)		
quite proud	0.101(0.076)		
very proud	0.338(0.078)***		
National identity (ref strongly disagree)			
disagree		0.082(0.097)	
agree		0.107(0.088)	
strongly agree		0.152(0.088)	
Cosmopolitan identity(ref strongly disagree)			
disagree			0.022(0.044)
agree			0.055(0.042)
strongly agree			0.124(0.043)*
Country level effects			
GDP pc PPP	-0.183(0.145)	-0.208(0.147)	-0.207(0.147)
N1	77521	78379	76133
N2	59	59	59

Individual level effects of nationalism and cosmopolitanism on attitudes towards government responsibility

	M6.1	M6.2	M6.3
Individual level effects			
age	-0.001(0.001)	-0.001(0.001)	-0.001(0.001)
gender	-0.062(0.020)**	-0.062(0.020)**	-0.062(0.020)**
education	0.041(0.005)***	0.041(0.005)***	0.041(0.005)***
Social class (ref upper)			
upper middle	-0.017(0.069)	-0.017(0.069)	-0.017(0.069)
lower middle	-0.284(0.068)***	-0.284(0.068)***	-0.284(0.068)***
working	-0.429(0.069)***	-0.429(0.069)***	-0.429(0.069)***
lower	-0.726(0.073)***	-0.726(0.073)***	-0.726(0.073)***
National pride (ref not proud at all)			
not very proud	0.079(0.082)	0.079(0.082)	0.079(0.082)
quite proud	0.256(0.076)*	0.256(0.076)*	0.256(0.076)*
very proud	0.373(0.076)**	0.373(0.076)**	0.373(0.076)**
National identity (ref strongly disagree)			
disagree		0.319(0.096)**	
agree		0.046(0.087)	
strongly agree		0.087(0.087)	
Cosmopolitan identity(ref strongly disagree)			
disagree			-0.041(0.044)
agree			0.010(0.041)
strongly agree			0.082(0.042)
Country level effects			
GDP pc PPP	0.303(0.153)*	0.283(0.136)	
N1	78110	78982	76557
N2	59	59	59

Individual level effects of nationalism and cosmopolitanism on attitudes towards economic competition

	M6.1	M6.2	M6.3
Individual level effects			
age	-0.001(0.001)	-0.001(0.001)	-0.001(0.001)
gender	-0.062(0.020)**	-0.062(0.020)**	-0.062(0.020)**
education	0.041(0.005)***	0.041(0.005)***	0.041(0.005)***
Social class (ref upper)			
upper middle	-0.017(0.069)	-0.017(0.069)	-0.017(0.069)
lower middle	-0.284(0.068)***	-0.284(0.068)***	-0.284(0.068)***
working	-0.429(0.069)***	-0.429(0.069)***	-0.429(0.069)***
lower	-0.726(0.073)***	-0.726(0.073)***	-0.726(0.073)***
National pride (ref not proud at all)			
not very proud	0.079(0.082)	0.079(0.082)	0.079(0.082)
quite proud	0.256(0.076)*	0.256(0.076)*	0.256(0.076)*
very proud	0.373(0.076)**	0.373(0.076)**	0.373(0.076)**
National identity (ref strongly disagree)			
disagree		0.319(0.096)**	
agree		0.046(0.087)	
strongly agree		0.087(0.087)	
Cosmopolitan identity(ref strongly disagree)			
disagree			-0.041(0.044)
agree			0.010(0.041)
strongly agree			0.082(0.042)
Country level effects			
GDP pc PPP	0.303(0.153)*	0.283(0.136)	
N1	78110	78982	76557
N2	59	59	59

Individual level effects of nationalism and cosmopolitanism on attitudes towards wealth accumulation

	M8.1	M8.2	M8.3
Individual level effects			
age	0.004(0.001)***	0.004(0.001)***	0.004(0.001)***
gender	0.119(0.019)***	0.119(0.019)***	0.119(0.019)***
education	0.028(0.005)***	0.028(0.005)***	0.028(0.005)***
Social class (ref upper)			
upper middle	0.299(0.066)***	0.299(0.066)***	0.299(0.066)***
lower middle	0.106(0.065)	0.106(0.065)	0.106(0.065)
working	0.010(0.066)	0.010(0.066)	0.010(0.066)
lower	-0.234(0.070)**	-0.234(0.070)**	-0.234(0.070)**
National pride (ref not proud at all)			
not very proud	0.015(0.079)		
quite proud	0.328(0.073)***		
very proud	0.542(0.073)***		
National identity (ref strongly disagree)			
Disagree		0.120(0.092)	
Agree		0.245(0.083)**	
strongly agree		0.444(0.082)***	
Cosmopolitan identity (ref strongly disagree)			
Disagree			0.015(0.042)
Agree			0.123(0.040)**
strongly agree			0.201(0.041)***
Country level effects			
GDP pc PPP	-0.063(0.105)	-0.079(0.107)	-0.083(0.106)
N1	76418	77268	75212
N2	59	59	59

Summary of Results

	National pride		National identity		Cosmopolitanism	
	individual	country	individual	country	individual	country
Income equality (lower - more equality to higher - more differences)	positive	positive	none	none	positive	positive
Government (lower) vs people (higher) should take more responsibility	<i>positive</i>	<i>none</i>	none	none	<i>none</i>	<i>positive</i>
Competition good (lower) vs harmful (higher)	negative	negative	negative	negative	none	none
Wealth accumulation only at the expense of others (lower) vs enough wealth for everyone (higher)	positive	positive	positive	positive	<i>positive</i>	<i>none</i>

Conclusions

Hypothesis 1 only partly confirmed: nationalism positively related to the support for free market economy at both individual and country levels.

Hypothesis 2 rejected: cosmopolitanism, when its effects are significant, influences economic attitudes in the same direction as nationalism



NATIONAL RESEARCH
UNIVERSITY

Thank you for your attention!

20, Myasnitskaya str., Moscow, Russia, 101000

Tel.: +7 (495) 628-8829, Fax: +7 (495) 628-7931

www.hse.ru

This report was presented at the 5th LCSR International Annual Conference “Cultural and Economic Changes under Cross-national Perspective”.

November 16 – 20, 2015 – Higher School of Economics, Moscow, Russia.

<http://lcsr.hse.ru/en/conf2015>

Настоящий доклад был представлен на V ежегодной международной конференции ЛССИ «Культурные и экономические изменения в сравнительной перспективе».

16-20 ноября 2015 года – НИУ ВШЭ, Москва, Россия.

<http://lcsr.hse.ru/en/conf2015>