Introduction
oo

Data
o

Empirical results
ooooooooooooooooooooooooooo

Conclusion

References

Petty Corruption In Russia: Non-Specialized Surveys Evidences

Andrey Aistov & Anastasia Rassadovskaya

National Research University Higher School of Economics
aaistov@hse.ru

4th LCSR International Conference
"Cultural and Economic Changes in Cross-National
Perspective"
November 10–14, 2014
Saint Petersburg, Russia

Motivation

- Road police in Russia. . .
- Is it possible to struggle against the grand corruption when petty corruption is a norm of daily behaviour?

        trust concerned. . .

- What do you think about unknown city when the first person that you meet cheat you? (Rothstein and Uslaner, 2005)

Questions

- Where petty corruptions is most frequent?
- Do perceptions depend on personal experience?
- What do we expect?

Non-specialized[1] surveys

- Russian Longitudinal Monitoring Survey – Higher School of Economics (RLMS-HSE)
  - 2001, 2006

Robustness check. . .

- World Values Survey (WVS)
- Life in Transition Survey (LITS)
- Business Environment and Enterprise Performance Survey (BEEPS)

---

[1] some questions about corruption

1 **Introduction**

2 **Data**

3 Empirical results

4 **Conclusion**

RLMS-HSE 2001 (95% confidence interval is gray)

Tell me, please, based on your experience, do people now have to give bribes to officials and law-enforcement officers?
(1 — Yes, 0 — No)

RLMS-HSE 2001 (95% confidence interval is gray)

Tell me, please, based on your experience, do people now have to give bribes to officials and law-enforcement officers?
(1 — Yes, 2 — No)

RLMS-HSE 2001 (95% confidence interval is gray)

Do you agree or disagree that it is not necessary to obey a law if you consider it to be unfair?
(1 — Agree completely, ..., 5 — Disagree completely)

Introduction
○○

Data
○

Empirical results
○○○●○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○

Conclusion
○

References

WVS (95% confidence interval is gray)

Justifiable: someone accepting a bribe
(1 — Always justifiable, . . . , 10 — Never justifiable)

Business Environment and Enterprise Performance Survey (BEEPS)

The court system is fair, impartial and uncorrupted
(1 — Strongly disagree, . . . , 4 — Strongly agree)

Introduction
○○

Data
○

Empirical results
○○○○○●○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○

Conclusion

References

RLMS-HSE, 2006

. . . how often have you personally had to pay in cash or gifts
immediately to the staff of these organizations, but not officially in
the cashier or bank?
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

0 --- Never, 1 --- Sometimes, 2 --- Every time   Number of answers

Spirman's coefficients of rang correlation, RLMS-HSE 2006

To what extent do you trust. . . (1 — Completely trust, . . . , 5 — Not referred)

Distrust \ Bribes	(1)	Court	Hous. registr.	Police	Suppl. of mu-nicip.serv.	Road police
Government of Russian Federation	0.084***	0.118**	0.056	0.115**	0.042*	0.198***
State Duma	0.066**	0.129**	0.002	0.116***	0.052**	0.186***
Courts	0.054*	0.269***	0.070**	0.146***	0.082***	0.176***
Army	0.056**	0.179***	0.061*	−0.010	0.020	0.121***
Police	0.048*	0.186***	0.011	0.164***	0.047**	0.205***
Russian banks	0.033	0.170***	0.026	0.103**	0.028	0.037
Foreign banks	0.068**	0.171***	0.016	0.093*	0.037	−0.003
Insurance companies	0.073**	0.050	0.041	0.063	0.009	0.054
Small and middle private business	−0.002	−0.022	−0.014	−0.040	−0.040*	−0.031
Political parties	0.068**	0.036	0.017	0.067	-0.030	0.148***

(1) — Passport and passport and visa services, registry offices

Binary logit (RLMS-HSE 2001)

Tell me, please, based on your experience, do people now have to give bribes to officials and law-enforcement officers?

$y = 1$ if Yes, 0 — No

$$\Pr(y_i = 1|x_i', \beta) = L(x_i'\beta) \equiv \frac{\exp(x_i'\beta)}{1 + \exp(x_i'\beta)}, \qquad (1)$$

x_i is vector of explanatory & control variables
β — vector of parameters

Binary logit (RLMS-HSE 2001) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to officials and law-enforcement officers (1 — Yes, 0 — No)

Age	0.039**
	(0.016)
Age^2/100	−0.054***
	(0.018)
ln(1 + Income)	0.038***
	(0.014)
Secondary school	0.113
	(0.217)
Initial vocational education	0.280
	(0.171)
Secondary vocational education	0.356**
	(0.173)
Higher education	0.654***
	(0.183)
Ph.D.(kandidat nauk)	0.626
	(0.404)
Female	−0.021
	(0.087)
City	0.476***
	(0.098)

(*continued*)	
North & North–West	0.373*
	(0.195)
Central & Central Black Soil	0.492***
	(0.147)
Volga–Vyatka & Volga basin	0.772***
	(0.158)
North Caucasus	0.254
	(0.157)
Ural	0.437***
	(0.160)
West Siberia	0.253
	(0.175)
Eastern Siberia & Far East	0.567***
	(0.178)
Constant	0.289
	(0.343)
Observations	6655
Pseudo R^2	0.026
Log Likelihood	-2107
χ^2	115

Binary logit (RLMS-HSE 2001) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to officials and law-enforcement officers (1 — Yes, 0 — No)

Significant

Age	0.039**
Age$^2/100$	–0.054***
$\ln(1 + \text{Income})$	0.038***
Secondary vocational education	0.356**
Higher education	0.654***
City	0.476***
North & North–West	0.373*
Central & Central Black Soil	0.492***
Volga–Vyatka & Volga basin	0.772***
Ural	0.437***
Eastern Siberia &	0.567***

* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006)

. . . how often have you personally had to pay in cash or gifts immediately to the staff of these organizations, but not officially in the cashier or bank?

Suppliers of Municipal Services, Housing Registration,
Passport & Passport and Visa Services & Registry Offices,
Police, Court, Road Police

$y = 0$ — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time

$$\Pr(y_i = 0|x_i', \beta) = L(\gamma_1 - x_i'\beta),$$
$$\Pr(y_i = 1|x_i', \beta) = L(\gamma_2 - x_i'\beta) - L(\gamma_1 - x_i'\beta), \qquad (2)$$
$$\Pr(y_i = 2|x_i', \beta) = 1 - L(\gamma_2 - x_i'\beta),$$

x_i is vector of explanatory & control variables
β — vector of parameters γ_1, γ_2 are parameters

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Passport & Passport and Visa
Services & Registry Offices
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Age	0.010	(*continued*)	
	(0.030)		
$\text{Age}^2 / 100$	−0.019	Central &	0.267
	(0.036)	Central Black Soil	(0.250)
$\ln(1 + \text{Income})$	0.037	Volga–Vyatka &	0.596**
	(0.025)	Volga basin	(0.242)
Secondary school	0.763**	North Caucasus	1.633***
	(0.385)		(0.254)
Initial vocational	−0.028	Ural	−0.204
education	(0.354)		(0.277)
Secondary vocational	0.310	West Siberia	−0.272
education	(0.351)		(0.321)
Higher education	0.481	Eastern Siberia &	0.829***
	(0.352)	Far East	(0.248)
Ph.D.(kandidat nauk)	0.921*	γ_1	2.203***
	(0.501)		(0.605)
Female	−0.035	γ_2	3.674***
	(0.143)		(0.613)
City	−0.004	Observations	1279
	(0.167)	Pseudo R^2	0.054
North &	0.722**	Log Likelihood	-881
North–West	(0.332)	χ^2	101

Standard errors in parentheses
* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Passport & Passport and Visa
Services & Registry Offices
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Significant

Secondary school	0.763**
Ph.D.(kandidat nauk)	0.921*
North &	0.722**
Volga–Vyatka & Volga basin	0.596**
North Caucasus	1.633***
Eastern Siberia & Far East	0.829***

* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Courts
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Age	0.055
	(0.064)
$Age^2/100$	−0.066
	(0.073)
$\ln(1 + Income)$	0.031
	(0.054)
Secondary school	−0.187
	(0.854)
Initial vocational education	−0.473
	(0.625)
Secondary vocational education	−0.842
	(0.645)
Higher education	−0.711
	(0.638)
Ph.D.(kandidat nauk)	−0.502
	(1.105)
Female	−0.029
	(0.263)
City	0.846***
	(0.303)
North & North–West	0.350
	(0.819)

(*continued*)	
Central & Central Black Soil	0.787
	(0.560)
Volga–Vyatka & Volga basin	0.720
	(0.555)
North Caucasus	2.065***
	(0.546)
Ural	−0.913
	(0.703)
West Siberia	0.123
	(0.629)
Eastern Siberia & Far East	0.980*
	(0.564)
γ_1	2.966**
	(1.428)
γ_2	4.446***
	(1.442)
Observations	353
Pseudo R^2	0.093
Log Likelihood	-247
χ^2	51

Standard errors in parentheses
* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Courts
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Significant

City	0.846***
North Caucasus	2.065***
Eastern Siberia & Far East	0.980*

* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Housing Registration
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Age	0.068*
	(0.040)
Age$^2/100$	−0.085*
	(0.045)
ln(1 + Income)	−0.016
	(0.033)
Secondary school	0.210
	(0.668)
Initial vocational education	0.542
	(0.541)
Secondary vocational education	0.178
	(0.539)
Higher education	0.596
	(0.533)
Ph.D.(kandidat nauk)	1.464**
	(0.664)
Female	−0.028
	(0.167)
City	−0.008
	(0.196)
North & North–West	0.338
	(0.488)

(*continued*)	
Central & Central Black Soil	0.919***
	(0.327)
Volga–Vyatka & Volga basin	0.994***
	(0.325)
North Caucasus	1.594***
	(0.340)
Ural	0.312
	(0.342)
West Siberia	0.578
	(0.396)
Eastern Siberia & Far East	1.454***
	(0.361)
γ_1	3.136***
	(0.965)
γ_2	4.452***
	(0.972)
Observations	808
Pseudo R^2	0.046
Log Likelihood	-632
χ^2	61

Standard errors in parentheses
* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Housing Registration
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Significant

Age	0.068*
Age$^2/100$	−0.085*
Ph.D.(kandidat nauk)	1.464**
Central & Central Black Soil	0.919***
Volga–Vyatka & Volga basin	0.994***
North Caucasus	1.594***
Eastern Siberia & Far East	1.454***

* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Police
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Age	0.068
	(0.052)
$Age^2/100$	–0.073
	(0.062)
$\ln(1 + Income)$	–0.025
	(0.038)
Secondary school	0.526
	(0.769)
Initial vocational education	0.741
	(0.578)
Secondary vocational education	0.517
	(0.602)
Higher education	0.311
	(0.595)
Ph.D.(kandidat nauk)	0.326
	(0.801)
Female	–0.686***
	(0.219)
City	0.178
	(0.272)
North & North–West	0.895*
	(0.520)

(*continued*)	
Central & Central Black Soil	0.249
	(0.376)
Volga–Vyatka & Volga basin	0.241
	(0.372)
North Caucasus	1.261***
	(0.384)
Ural	–0.376
	(0.363)
West Siberia	–1.500**
	(0.589)
Eastern Siberia & Far East	–0.253
	(0.435)
γ_1	2.231**
	(1.058)
γ_2	4.292***
	(1.075)
Observations	450
Pseudo R^2	0.088
Log Likelihood	-340
χ^2	66

Standard errors in parentheses
* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Police
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Significant

Female	–0.686***
North & North–West	0.895*
North Caucasus	1.261***
West Siberia	–1.500**

* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Suppliers of Municipal Services
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Age	0.008
	(0.021)
Age$^2/100$	−0.014
	(0.023)
$\ln(1 + \text{Income})$	−0.005
	(0.021)
Secondary school	−0.131
	(0.324)
Initial vocational education	−0.093
	(0.255)
Secondary vocational education	−0.086
	(0.252)
Higher education	0.181
	(0.250)
Ph.D.(kandidat nauk)	0.120
	(0.367)
Female	−0.010
	(0.102)
City	0.191
	(0.137)
North & North–West	−0.086
	(0.225)

(*continued*)	
Central & Central Black Soil	0.240
	(0.149)
Volga–Vyatka & Volga basin	−0.145
	(0.162)
North Caucasus	0.654***
	(0.189)
Ural	−0.208
	(0.163)
West Siberia	−0.189
	(0.199)
Eastern Siberia & Far East	0.107
	(0.174)
γ_1	0.704
	(0.526)
γ_2	2.186***
	(0.529)
Observations	2016
Pseudo R^2	0.011
Log Likelihood	-1811
χ^2	40

Standard errors in parentheses
* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Suppliers of Municipal Services
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Significant

North Caucasus	0.654***

* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Road Police
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Age	0.064*
	(0.035)
Age^2/100	−0.083**
	(0.042)
ln(1 + Income)	0.019
	(0.029)
Secondary school	0.589
	(0.852)
Initial vocational education	0.326
	(0.785)
Secondary vocational education	0.317
	(0.789)
Higher education	0.641
	(0.782)
Ph.D.(kandidat nauk)	0.783
	(0.901)
Female	−0.168
	(1.177)
City	0.554***
	(0.168)
North & North–West	−0.423
	(0.351)

(*continued*)	
Central & Central Black Soil	−0.276
	(0.237)
Volga–Vyatka & Volga basin	−0.199
	(0.229)
North Caucasus	0.568**
	(0.247)
Ural	−0.628**
	(0.253)
West Siberia	−1.559***
	(0.329)
Eastern Siberia & Far East	−0.342
	(0.270)
γ_1	1.507
	(0.995)
γ_2	3.527***
	(1.001)
Observations	854
Pseudo R^2	0.047
Log Likelihood	-846
χ^2	84

Standard errors in parentheses
* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

Ordered logit (RLMS-HSE 2006) (*continued*)

Dependent variable: Bribes to Road Police
(0 — Never, 1 — Sometimes, 2 — Every time)

Significant

Age	0.064*
Age$^2/100$	–0.083**
City	0.554***
North Caucasus	0.568**
Ural	–0.628**
West Siberia	–1.559***

* — 10%, ** — 5%, *** — 1%.

RLMS-HSE 2001 (95% confidence interval is gray)

Do you think, in comparison to the past, bribes are given more often now, less often, or at the same rate?
(–1 — Less often, 0 — At the same rate, 2 — More often)

Life in Transition Survey (LITS)

2006: There is less corruption now than around 1989

2010: There is less corruption now than around 4 years ago

(1 — Strongly disagree, . . . , 5 — Strongly agree)

2006 vs. 1989   2010 vs. 2006

Introduction
oo

Data
o

Empirical results
oooooooooooooooooooooooo●o

Conclusion

References

Conclusion

- Corruption perceptions depend on personal experience
  - Level of education and town habitation increase confidence in necessity of bribes
  - Concave dependence of corruption expectations on age with statistically significant plateau in ages of 25–55 years
- Supply side. . .
  - Confidence in necessity to give bribes grows wuth personal income
- What we expect?
  - The most of 25–55 years old respondents say about necessity to give bribes to officials and workers of law enforcement bodies
  - Retrospective questions confirm that corruption in Russia did not decrease during the last decades

Introduction
○○

Data
○

Empirical results
○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○○●

Conclusion

References

Thank you !

Bo Rothstein and Eric M. Uslaner. All for all: Equality, corruption, and social trust. *World Politics*, 58(1):41–72, 10 2005. URL http://search.proquest.com/docview/274362727?accountid=45451. Copyright - Copyright Johns Hopkins University Press Oct 2005; Document feature - Graphs; Tables; Last updated - 2012-02-25; CODEN - WOPOBI.