POLITICAL TRUST AND ASIAN SOCIETIES: EXPLAINING CHINESE EXCEPTIONALISM TO THE "PARADOX OF DISTANCE"

Cary Wu and Rima Wilkes University of British Columbia Vancouver, B.C. Musqueam Territory



THE PARADOX OF DISTANCE:

- Paradox: A statement that is contradictory but could also be true
- All animals are equal, but some are more equal than others
- You shouldn't go in the water until you know how to swim





THE PARADOX OF DISTANCE AND TRUST IN GOVERNMENT:

• We distrust government except we trust government

• Circumstances under which this is true:

government generally = negative programs and officials = positive



CHINESE EXCEPTIONALISM:



OUR CONTRIBUTION:

• To consider the <u>paradox of distance at the individual</u> <u>level</u>

- To <u>explain Chinese exceptionalism</u> to the paradox of distance
- How? 2005-2008 Asia Barometer data



HIERARCHICAL STRUCTURE OF INSTITUTIONAL TRUST



OTHER ASIAN SOCIETIES:



OTHER ASIAN SOCIETIES



TRUST IN NATIONAL/LOCAL GOVERNMENT

	Only National	Only Local	Completely Distrust	Completely Trust
Mainland China	34.72	0.37	4.86	60.05
Japan	4.83	26.45	50.05	18.66
Hong Kong	6.99	10.77	12.73	69.51
South Korea	6.7	17.44	67.4	8.46
Mongolia	18.52	18.1	23.87	39.51
Philippin	9.11	27.32	32.01	31.56
Taiwan	8.47	25.2	35.84	30.49
Thailand	8.61	18.76	15.16	57.47
Indonesia	8.11	15.11	16.62	60.16
Singapore	11.08	3.66	5.69	79.57
Vietnam	7.27	0.77	1.11	90.85
Cambodia	10.44	14.93	12.01	62.63
Malaysia	9.7	9.16	16.17	64.96

Table 1. Trust in National/Local Government across Asian Countries (%)*

* Data from Asian Barometer Survey, 2005-2008.



WHY TRUST NATIONAL MORE THAN LOCAL?



THREE EXPLANATIONS OF CHINESE EXCEPTIONALISM



SURVEILLANCE:

- Afraid to express themselves on surveys
- Also high media censorship

• Expectations: increase trust in national relative to local government

CULTURE:

• Chinese tradition of respect for hierarchy and authority

- This may not work for critical citizens
- Expectations: increase trust in national relative to local government

PERFORMANCE:

• Strong Chinese economy and rapid economic development

• Expectations: increase trust in national relative to local government

DATA AND METHODS



DV: Trust National Government More (TNGM) "1=trust national government>trust local government" "0=trust national government<=trust local government"

DATA AND METHODS

<u>Surveillance:</u> fear and media

"people are <u>free to speak</u> what they think <u>without fear</u>"

"how often do you <u>follow news</u> about politics and gvt?"

<u>Culture</u>: traditional and critical values

"the relationship between the government and the people should be like that between the <u>head and the family</u>"

"<u>open quarrels</u> among politicians are <u>harmful</u> to society"

<u>Performance</u>: economic and political

"how would you rate the overall <u>economic condition</u> of our country today"

"how would you describe the present <u>political situation</u> in our country"

	Model (1)	Model (2)	Model (3)	Model (4)	Model (5)	Model (6)	Model (7)
	Pooled	Pooled	Pooled	Pooled	Pooled	China	Other
	Sample	Sample	Sample	Sample	Sample	Ciiiia	Countries
Intercent	-1.476***	-1.585***	-1.340***	-2.132***	-1.952***	-0.171	-1.899***
intercept	(0.069)	(0.118)	(0.132)	(0.107)	(0.171)	(0.438)	(0.192)
China	1.933***	1.927***	1.935***	1.711***	1.700***		
	(0.048)	(0.049)	(0.048)	(0.055)	-0.056		
Surveillance							
Political Fear		-0.002			-0.009	0.007	-0.012
i ontical i cal		(0.010)			(0.01)	(0.026)	(0.011)
Media Exposure		0.036*			0.033	0.101**	0.009
Media Exposure		(0.017)			(0.017)	(0.033)	(0.02)
Culture							
Traditionalism			0.002		-0.021	-0.071	-0.023
Traditionalishi			(0.028)		(0.028)	(0.077)	(0.03)
Critical Values			-0.064*		-0.075**	0.296***	-0.140***
Citilear Varaes			(0.026)		(0.026)	(0.072)	(0.028)
Performance							
Economic				0.109***	0.109***	-0.01	0.135***
				(0.026)	(0.026)	(0.061)	(0.029)
Political				0.098***	0.102***	-0.029	0.132***
				(0.025)	(0.026)	(0.064)	(0.028)
Controls							
Female	-0.065	-0.058	-0.068	-0.052	-0.05	-0.124	-0.019
	(0.041)	(0.041)	(0.041)	(0.041)	(0.041)	(0.074)	(0.049)
Urban	-0.116*	-0.113*	-0.117*	-0.079	-0.083	0.096	-0.132*
	(0.046)	(0.046)	(0.046)	(0.046)	(0.046)	(0.099)	(0.054)
Education (Ref. Elementary)	•••	•••	•••	•••	•••	•••	•••
Secondary	0.162***	0.148**	0.161**	0.168***	0.154**	0.203*	0.11
Ş	(0.049)	(0.049)	(0.049)	(0.049)	(0.05)	(0.084)	(0.062)
University	-0.044	-0.068	-0.042	0.006	-0.022	-0.367*	0.034
	(0.068)	(0.069)	(0.068)	(0.068)	(0.07)	(0.17)	(0.079)
Age (Ref.17-30)	•••	•••	•••	•••	•••	•••	•••
31-50	0.052	0.039	0.054	0.071	0.062	-0.076	0.121
	(0.053)	(0.053)	(0.053)	(0.053)	(0.053)	(0.108)	(0.062)
51 and above	0.042	0.020	0.044	0.052	0.035	-0.158	0.159*
	(0.060)	(0.061)	(0.060)	(0.060)	(0.061)	(0.121)	(0.072)
pseudo R^2	0.132	0.132	0.132	0.136	0.137	0.013	0.012
$LR \chi^2$	2284	2289	2391	2351	2364	56	132

 Table 3. Logistic Regression on Trust National Government More (TNGM) †

Standard errors in parentheses * p < 0.05, ** p < 0.01, *** p < 0.001

† N(pooled sample)=14423; N(China)=3270; N(other Asian countries)=11153

	Chi	na†	Other Asian Countries††		
(Ref. Equal)	National More	Local More	National More	Local More	
Intercent	-0.002	-1.038	-1.119***	0.570**	
Intercept	(0.448)	(1.460)	(0.199)	(0.183)	
Surveillance					
Political Fear	0.004	-0.068	-0.003	0.033**	
Tonucal Teal	(0.027)	(0.091)	(0.012)	(0.011)	
Media Exposure	0.106**	0.085	0.024	0.047*	
Media Exposure	(0.034)	(0.117)	(0.020)	(0.019)	
Culture					
Traditionalism	-0.082	-0.217	-0.020	0.009	
Traditionalism	(0.079)	(0.267)	(0.032)	(0.029)	
Critical Value	0.319***	0.401	-0.150***	-0.036	
Ciffical Value	(0.074)	(0.246)	(0.029)	(0.027)	
Performance					
Economic	-0.020	-0.173	0.079**	-0.197***	
Leonomie	(0.062)	(0.202)	(0.030)	(0.027)	
Dolitical	-0.052	-0.371	0.022	-0.386***	
Fondear	(0.065)	(0.200)	(0.029)	(0.028)	
Controls					
Famala	-0.093	0.576*	-0.050	-0.105*	
remate	(0.076)	(0.269)	(0.051)	(0.047)	
Urban	0.096	0.006	-0.168**	-0.132*	
Orban	(0.101)	(0.357)	(0.056)	(0.053)	
Education (Ref. Elementary)	•••	•••	•••	•••	
Secondary	0.207*	0.057	0.112	0.000	
Secondary	(0.085)	(0.297)	(0.064)	(0.061)	
University	-0.409*	-1.078	0.069	0.114	
Oniversity	(0.171)	(0.778)	(0.082)	(0.074)	
Age (Ref.17-30)	•••	•••	•••	•••	
31-50	-0.077	-0.011	0.079	-0.147*	
51-50	(0.110)	(0.372)	(0.065)	(0.059)	
51 and above	-0.166	-0.188	0.144	-0.055	
	(0.123)	(0.433)	(0.075)	(0.069)	

. 1 11

Standard errors in parentheses

* p < 0.05, ** p < 0.01, *** p < 0.001

† N(China) =3270, psedudo R2=0.016, LR χ^2 =77;

†† N(Others)=11153, psedudo R2=0.029, LRχ²=641.

SUMMARY OF KEY RESULTS:

- <u>Surveillance</u>: <u>Media exposure</u> leads to TNGM in China and has opposite effect in other Asian societies
- <u>Culture</u>: <u>Critical citizens</u> TNGM in China and opposite in other Asian societies
- <u>Performance: Economic and political has little</u> effect in China and helps national government in other Asian societies

Georg Simmel Secret et sociétés secrètes



Simmel: Metaphysical faith

"This confidence in regard to another is mediated neither by experiences nor by hypotheses: it is a primary, fundamental attitudes toward the other" (1950:390)

CONCLUSION: IMPLICATIONS FOR TRUST SCHOLARS

- <u>Measures of Trust</u>: at the individual level additive vs. hierarchical
- <u>Theoretical models</u>: Chinese exceptionalism, Western theoretical models do not hold.



Cary Wu carywooruc@gmail.com

Rima Wilkes wilkesr@mail.ubc.ca

Department of Sociology University of British Columbia