Collecting the Nation? Nationalism between the Invention of Tradition and Daily Plebiscite

Marharyta Fabrykant

Saint Petersburg, 27th April 2013

Outline

- Theoretical background.

- Hypotheses.

- Dependent and independent variables.

- Results.

- Preliminary conclusions.

Nationalism as Collectivism

E.Hobsbawm – *invention of tradition*:
nationalism requires and produces a sense of
unity with past generations –
diachronic collectivism.

E.Renan – *daily plebiscite*:
shared past is inessential, provided the
contingent sense of unity with (some!)
contemporaries –
synchronic collectivism.

Main Hypothesis

Synchronic collectivism is stronger related to ingroup nationalism (IGN) than to outgroup nationalism (OGN), and diachronic collectivism, on the contrary, is stronger related to outgroup than ingroup nationalism.

Auxiliary Hypothesis

coefficients of variation (the standard deviation divided by the mean) for all indicators of collectivism are negatively related to both ingroup and outgroup nationalism.

Ingroup Nationalism

- **"How proud are you of your nation"** (answer: "very proud", "quite proud", "not very proud", "not at all proud").

- **"Of course, we all hope that there will not be another war, but if it were to come to that, would you be willing to fight for your country?"** (answer: "yes", "depends", "no").

Outgroup Nationalism

- **"Immigrants/foreign workers are undesirable neighbors"** (answer: yes or no).

- **"When jobs are scarce, preference should be given to natives over immigrants"** (answer: yes or no).

- **"How about people from other countries coming here to work. Which one of the following do you think the government should do?"** ("let anyone come", "let anyone come as long as jobs are available", "set strict limits to coming to country", "prohibit people from coming").

Synchronic collectivism

- **"Service to other important in life"** ("very important, "rather important", "not very important", "not at all important").

- **"Membership"** (a mean of dichotomous variables indicating membership in various voluntary associations).

- **"Schwartz: it is important to this person to help the people nearby"** ("very much like me", "like me", "somewhat like me", "a little like me", "not like me", "not at all like me").

- **"Most people can be trusted"** (vs "Can't be too careful").

- **"Work is a duty toward society"** ("strongly agree", "agree", "neither agree nor disagree", "disagree", "strongly disagree").

Diachronic collectivism

- **"Schwartz: it is important to this person tradition"** ("very much like me", "like me", "somewhat like me", "a little like me", "not like me", "not at all like me").

- **"Tradition vs high economic growth"** ("tradition", "high economic growth", "both", "neither", "other").

- **"National goals: maintaining order in the nation"** ("very important, "rather important", "not very important", "not at all important").

- **"New and old ideas"** (ten-point scale from "ideas that stood the test of time are generally best" to "new ideas are generally better than old ones").

Synchronic collectivism (1)

	IGN	OGN
service to others important in life	0.131 (0.039) /0.470)/**	0.037 (0.047) /0.123/
R^2	22.1	1.5

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.
** - significant at 0.01 level.

Synchronic collectivism (2)

	IGN	OGN
membership	0.792 (0.270) /0.444/**	-0.017 (0.292) /-0.010/
R^2	19.7	0

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

** - significant at 0.01 level.

Synchronic collectivism (3)

	IGN	OGN
Schwartz: helping other people important	0.100 (0.040) /0.336/*	0.007 (0,045) /0.022/
R^2	11.3	0

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

* - significant at 0.05 level.

Synchronic collectivism (4)

	IGN	OGN
most people can be trusted	-0.161 (0.082) / -0.202/*	-0.029 (0.084) /-0.288/**
R^2	4.1	8.3

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

* - significant at 0.05 level.

** - significant at 0.01 level.

Synchronic collectivism (5)

	IGN	OGN
work as duty toward society	0.205 (0.030) /0.654/***	0.138 (0.038) /0.427/***
R^2	42.8	18.3

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

*** - significant at 0.001 level.

Diachronic collectivism (1)

	IGN	OGN
Schwartz: tradition important	0.127 (0.021) /0.653/***	0.126 (0.024) /0.602/***
R^2	42.7	36.2

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

*** - significant at 0.001 level.

Diachronic collectivism (2)

	IGN	OGN
tradition vs economic growth	-0.071 (0.049) /-0.197/	-0.137 (0.042) /-0.415/**
R^2	3.9	17.3

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

** - significant at 0.01 level.

Diachronic collectivism (3)

	IGN	OGN
national goals: maintaining order in the nation	0.335 (0.103) /0.506/**	0.245 (0.087) /0.450/**
R^2	25.6	20.2

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

** - significant at 0.01 level.

Diachronic collectivism (4)

	IGN	OGN
old vs new ideas	-0.041 (0.014) /-0.346/**	0.010 (0.017) /0.079/
R^2	12.0	0.8

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

** - significant at 0.01 level.

Synchronic collectivism (i)

	IGN	OGN
service to others important in life (coefficient of variation)	-0.323 (0.246) /-0.205/	-0.309 (0.264) /-0.184/
R^2	4.2	3.4

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

Synchronic collectivism (ii)

	IGN	OGN
Szwartz: helping other people important (coefficient of variation)	-0.451 (0.375) /-0.168/	0.117 (408) /0.041/
R^2	2.8	0.2

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

Synchronic collectivism (iii)

	IGN	OGN
membership (coefficient of variation)	-0.067 (0.032) /-0.332/*	0.046 (0.032) /0.237/
R^2	11.0	5.6

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

* - significant at 0.05 level.

Synchronic collectivism (iv)

	IGN	OGN
most people can be trusted (coefficient of variaton)	-1.009 (0.301) /-0.338/***	-0.085 (0.323) /-0.029/
R^2	11.5	0

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

*** - significant at 0.05 level.

Synchronic collectivism (v)

	IGN	OGN
work as duty toward society (coefficient of variation)	-1.064 (0.204) /-0.555/***	-0.889 (0.230) /-0.447/***
R^2	30.8	20.0

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

*** - significant at 0.001 level.

Diachronic collectivism (i)

	IGN	OGN
Schwartz: tradition important (coefficien of variation)	-0.800 (0.158) /-0.582/***	-0.948 (0.160) /-0.643/***
R^2	33.9	41.3

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

*** - significant at 0.001 level.

Diachronic collectivism (ii)

	IGN	OGN
tradition vs economic growth (coefficient of variation)	0.119 (0.250) /0.067/	0.479 (0.222) /0.292/*
R^2	0.4	8.7

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

* - significant at 0.05 level.

Diachronic collectivism (iii)

	IGN	OGN
National goals: maintaining order in the nation (coefficient of variation)	-1.399 (0.522) /-0.434/**	-1.173 (0.428) /-0.442/**
R^2	18.8	19.5

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

** - significant at 0.01 level.

Diachronic collectivism (iv)

	IGN	OGN
old vs new ideas (coefficient of variation)	0.391 (0.096) /0.472/***	0.276 (0.108) /0.322/**
R^2	22.3	10.3

Note: Standard errors are given in parentheses, standardized coefficients in brackets.

** - significant at 0.01 level.*** - significant at 0.001 level.

Some Preliminary Conclusions

- The main hypothesis is mostly confirmed for synchronic collectivism, but not for diachronic collectivism. It appears that both synchronic and diachronic collectivism are stronger related to ingroup nationalism than to outgroup nationalism.

- The auxiliary hypothesis was confirmed. The variation in both synchronic and diachronic collectivism is negatively related to both ingroup and outgroup nationalism.

Thank you for your attention!